



**Tinkers' Heart
Consultation Analysis Report**

**Historic Scotland
Heritage Management Directorate
Victoria Clements
18 June 2015**

Table of Contents

Section 1: Acknowledgements.....	3
Section 2: Executive Summary.....	3
Section 3: Introduction.....	4
Section 4: Responses.....	6
Section 5: Findings.....	7
Section 6: Conclusions.....	10
Section 7: Annexes.....	11

Section 1: Acknowledgements

1. Historic Scotland would like to thank all those who responded to this consultation document by providing written or verbal comments.

Section 2: Executive Summary

2. Historic Scotland is pleased to announce the findings of the consultation on Tinkers' Heart.
3. Tinkers' Heart is a formation of quartz stones laid into the surface of the old road between Cairndow and Strachur, overlooking Loch Fyne in Argyll. The site is important to the Scottish Traveller (referred to in this document as 'Travellers') community but there is little documented history available on the site and its significance.
4. Between 9 March and 15 May 2015 Historic Scotland ran a public consultation which sought views and information on Tinkers' Heart. The consultation sought information and documentary evidence about the site itself, and information on how people knew about the site and what it means to them. 51 responses were received.

Section 3: Introduction

Background to the Consultation

5. Tinkers' Heart is a heart-shaped setting of quartz stones embedded in the tarmac of what was formerly a junction of the A815 and B839 roads, near Cairndow, Argyll & Bute. The public roads have been realigned and moved to the east, leaving the monument within a pasture field. Oral tradition suggests that the stone setting was originally created to commemorate individuals from the Traveller community who took part in the Jacobite Rising of 1745. More recently, it has served as a traditional site for wedding celebrations among the Traveller community.
6. A petition was lodged on 29 May 2014 with the Scottish parliament to call on the Scottish Government to direct Historic Scotland 'to investigate what action can be taken to ensure the restoration and preservation of the Heart'. The petition was signed by over 1,100 people in spring 2014, many from the Traveller community, as well as many members of settled communities. The representations made to Parliament have highlighted the importance of the site to the Traveller community and people of Argyll. The strength of that evidence has led Historic Scotland to re-examine the evidence for the cultural significance of the site.
7. A major part of the review was looking at the value that the travelling community and local settled people ascribe to the site. Therefore, a public consultation was undertaken to find any stories, reminiscences or first-hand accounts about the part the site played in the lives of these communities. In addition, further desk-based research on the site was undertaken, along with field visits to the site and interviews with interested parties. The results of the desk-based research are presented in the Desk-based and Field Research Report.
8. The consultation on Tinkers' Heart commenced on 09 March 2015 and the consultation period closed on 15 May 2015. It is available at: www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/index/about/consultations/closedconsultations. The consultation invited views and information on Tinkers' Heart.

Report Objectives

9. This document fulfils the requirement for an Analysis Report set out in the Scottish Government's good practice guidance on consultation. The aim of this report is to analyse and report on the responses made to the consultation on Tinkers' Heart to inform an assessment of the site for inclusion on the Schedule of monuments of National Importance.
10. This report does not set out Historic Scotland's comments on, or responses to, those suggestions. The inclusion of a response or suggestion does not imply that the contribution is accepted as accurately characterising Historic Scotland's position, or what may be included in the content of the final assessment.

11. You can find a summary of the findings of the consultation in section 6 – Copies of this report can be downloaded from www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/index/about/consultations/closedconsultations

Printouts may be requested from:

Historic Scotland
Heritage Management Directorate
Longmore House
Salisbury Place
Edinburgh EH9 1SH
Or hs.heritagemanagement@scotland.gsi.gov.uk

Methodology

12. The responses were recorded, organised and summarised on a spreadsheet. Written and verbal responses to the consultation were received and recorded. A record was made of the key themes and issues raised. A frequency count was made of the overall number of responses by interest group and of the responses to each question. A qualitative analysis was then carried out using this framework. A summary for each question was reviewed, and key themes and views were identified.
13. The findings of this report are specific to the consultation exercise and do not necessarily reflect the weight or range of views within the population as a whole.

Distribution and Advertising

14. This consultation was advertised on the Historic Scotland media web pages on 09 March 2015. The consultation was also publicised in articles in the Herald Scotland, local press, and on social media. Thirty-five stakeholders and organisations were also notified by email at the beginning of the consultation period. The main consultation was open and directed towards the general public.

Section 4: Responses

Introduction

15. The following statistical analysis sets out the number of organisations and individuals who responded to the consultation document in writing, broken down by interest group/sector, and compares them to the numbers who were notified about the consultation exercise. The consultation asked for responses to five general questions.
16. Some organisations represent more than one interest. In these cases the general nature of the response has been used as a guide in order to facilitate the statistical analysis.

Breakdown of Responses

Responses by interest group/sector

17. A total of 51 responses were received to the consultation. Breakdown of responses by interest group/sector is provided in table 1 below.

Respondent Type	Number	% of all respondents
Private individual	33	64.7
Local authority	5	9.8
Heritage body	3	5.9
Amenity group	7	13.7
Private sector	1	2
Public body	0	0
Academic Institution	2	3.9
Total	51	100

Table 1: Responses by interest group/sector

Responses by interest group/sector relative to distribution list

Respondent Type	Invited	Invited Responded	% Return	Unsolicited Responded
Private individual	n/a	n/a	n/a	33
Local authority	14	5	35.7	
Heritage body	2	1	50	2
Amenity group	13	5	38.5	1
Private sector	n/a	n/a	n/a	1
Public body	n/a	n/a	n/a	
Academic Institution	4	2	50	
Total	33	13	n/a	36

Section 5: Findings

Question 1: What do you know about the Tinkers' Heart?

18. 64.7% of respondents provided a direct response to this question.

"I know the Tinkers' Heart is a site of extreme importance for the Scottish Travelling community. I believe it is where, for generations, marriages would take place" (A private individual)

"The Tinkers' Heart needs its status as a place of oath and culture that goes right back to when Scotland was made up of clans. All my Argyll people would have been connected to this place. The stones have witnessed births, baptisms, death, joy, laughter and tears and it's a place of culture." (A private individual)

19. 19.6% of respondents stated that they did not know or had not heard about Tinkers' Heart prior to the consultation.

Question 2: How did you hear about the Tinkers' Heart?

20. 49% of respondents stated that they had heard of Tinkers' Heart through the media interest surrounding the Public Petition to the Scottish Parliament.

21. 31.4% stated that they had heard of the site prior to the Public Petition or from another source.

"I only became aware of the Tinkers' Heart while at High School in Renfrew in the mid 90's. I was amongst a class group driving to Ardentinn Outdoor Centre for a week of activities. Our lead teacher, who must have already known about the site, took a detour so that we could stop and see it, and learn a little of its background as a Traveller wedding site." (A private individual)

"Knowledge of the Tinkers' Heart has been passed down to me by family and friends." (A private individual)

22. 19.6% did not indicate how they had heard about Tinkers' Heart.

Question 3: Do you have or know of any stories, songs, or reminiscences about the Tinkers' Heart?

23. 19.6% of respondents indicated that they had reminiscences or stories about the site.

"My Granny, known as Perthshire Nancy or Black Nancy, was born in Argyllshire. I remember her talking about weddings and distinctly remember her talking about the Tinkers' Heart. We used to talk about 'jumping over the broom' but she used to say 'I know better, do you know about the Tinkers' Heart' but sadly she never went into any detail, and we were too young to ask." (A private individual)

“One lady, who is in her late 60s remembers as a child watching a Christening take place at the Heart, She lived not far from the site and remembers it as a special place” (A private individual)

24. 80.4% of respondents indicated that they had no further information specifically about Tinkers’ Heart.

Question 4: Do you have or know of any photographs, drawings, sketches or similar documentary evidence for the Tinkers’ Heart?

25. No respondents indicated that they had any documentary evidence relating to Tinkers’ Heart.
26. 9.8% of the respondents stated that they did not feel that documentary evidence should be required to demonstrate the cultural significance of the site as the culture of the Traveller community is primarily based on an oral tradition.

“While I understand your need to evidence this spot as being historical to travellers, please try and understand the importance of oral tradition to a people who, in the main, did not read or write” (A private individual)

Question 5: What does the Tinkers’ Heart mean to you and what do you think it means to people generally?

27. 60.8% of respondents felt that Tinkers’ Heart is important / special.

“It is a place that is in the stories my family (and other families) pass down the generations and therefore it is an important part of my culture.” (A private individual)

28. 72.5% suggested that the site is important to the Scottish Traveller community.

“The Tinkers’ Heart is of great importance to the Scottish Traveller community, and thus, for me, it is a site of great importance for Scottish culture and history. Scotland is a diverse, multicultural nation, and it is important that the rich heritage of the Travellers is recognised and represented within Scotland.” (A private individual)

“As far as today’s Travellers are concerned, however, the Heart’ has always been there and has always been important. Its status is, essentially, symbolic and ritualistic. It is lodged in the collective and individual cultural memory as a place for friends to come together, for ‘meetings’ to be held to strike bargains or resolve disputes, and as a place for Traveller-tradition namings, weddings and commemorations of the dead.” (A heritage body)

29. 15.7% of respondents indicated that Tinkers' Heart is important to the local settled community / non-Travellers.
30. 2% of respondents indicated that Tinkers' Heart is only locally important.

Additional Comments:

31. 33.3% of respondents indicated that they felt the monument was very rare or the only monument to the Traveller community.

"Their interaction with the landscape, then, has been very light and they have left few permanent marks, which makes the Tinkers' Heart so remarkable, as one of the few tangible monuments to the culture." (A private individual)

"The Tinkers' Heart is a distinctive and unusual monument and one that appears, on current evidence, to be a unique feature." (An academic institution)

32. 62.7% indicated that Tinkers' Heart should be given protection/recognition.
33. 17.6% of respondents suggested that they felt Scottish Traveller culture or Scottish culture as a whole would be diminished if Tinkers' Heart were to be removed or lost.
34. Opinion was expressed that the site can provide unique information and has the potential to contribute to our knowledge of the past.

"This is a monument offering a tangible, physical link with the past... It is part of Scotland's identity and is valuable both for its own sake and as a resource for research, education, regeneration, leisure and tourism." (A private individual)

"There is also considerable research potential to better situate this monument within its immediate and wider regional landscape context as both site on an important routeway but also from the perspective of exploring the importance of both its material and intangible heritage value in Argyll and to better understand its wider symbolic importance for members of the Traveller community and descendants." (An academic institution)

35. Several respondents indicated that giving some form of recognition to Tinkers' Heart would help to make Traveller culture more visible, raise awareness and may help to reduce prejudice against the community.

"One practical way in which the heritage sector in Scotland could help to tackle the prejudice faced by Travellers would be to give the Scottish Travellers their rightful place in the story of Scotland and of the people who have lived here over the last 10,000 years. By giving Travellers greater visibility and by interpreting this piece of

Traveller heritage Historic Scotland can help to tackle the ignorance which leads to ongoing prejudice against this ethnic minority.” (A private individual)

Section 6: Conclusions

36. A large number of the respondents (72.5%) stated that Tinkers’ Heart is a very important site for the Scottish Traveller community.
37. Some respondents also stated that the site is important to the local non-travelling community and an important feature in the cultural heritage of the Cairndow area.
38. 62.7% of respondents indicated that Tinkers’ Heart should be given protection and recognition.
39. No information was provided by respondents to give an indication of the origin of the site.
40. No new photographs, drawings, sketches or similar documentary evidence of the site was provided by any respondent in the consultation.

Section 7: Annexes

Consultation Questions

Please provide any information you have regarding the Tinkers' Heart. We have highlighted some questions below which you may wish to answer. If there is not enough space under these questions please add additional comments at the end or send a separate letter/email.

Q1 What do you know about the Tinkers' Heart?

Q2 How did you hear about the Tinkers' Heart?

Q3 Do you have or know of any stories, songs, or reminiscences about the Tinkers' Heart?

Q4 Do you have or know of any photographs, drawings, sketches or similar documentary evidence for the Tinkers' Heart? (please do not send us original photographs / documents)

Q5 What does the Tinkers' Heart mean to you and what do you think it means to people generally?

Additional comments

Distribution List

Amenity Groups

Cairndow Community Council
Bute Community Council
Dunoon Community Council
Kilfinan Community Council
South Cowal Community Council
Ardentinny Community Council
Colintraive & Glendaruel Community Council
Hunter's Quay Community Council
Kilmun Community Council
Lochgoil Community Council
Sandbank Community Council
Strachur Community Council
Lochgilphead Community Council

Heritage Bodies

The Auchindrain Trust
Kilmartin Museum

Local Authority Archaeology Services

Aberdeenshire Council Archaeology Service (also Angus & Moray)
City of Edinburgh Council Archaeology Service
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar Archaeology Service
Dumfries and Galloway Council Archaeology Service
East Lothian & Midlothian Councils Archaeology Service
Falkirk Community Trust
Fife Council Archaeology Service
Highland Council Archaeology Service
Orkney Islands County Archaeologist
Perth & Kinross Heritage Trust
Scottish Borders Council Archaeology Service
Shetland Amenity Trust
Stirling & Clackmannanshire Councils Archaeology Service
West of Scotland Archaeology Service

Academic Institutions

University of Edinburgh – School of Scottish Studies
University of Glasgow

**University of West of Scotland
University of Aberdeen – Elphinstone Institute**

Local Ministers

**Lochgoilhead and Kilmorich Church
St Margarets, Lochgilphead**